

Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES)

Results and Plan 2019

INTRODUCTION

1. This paper provides :
 - An update on actions taken by the Trust in response to our WRES results for 2018
 - A summary of the WRES data submitted by Mid Yorkshire to NHS England for 2019
 - An outline of the actions we are planning to take in 2019/20 in response to the 2019 WRES results

ACTIONS TAKEN IN 2018/19

2. Support

BAME Focus Groups

A series of BAME Focus Groups were held in June/July 2018, led the Chief Executive. In total over 20 staff attended one of the three sessions to explore the WRES results for 2018, share their experiences in the Trust and priorities areas for improvement in 2018/19.

In this latest series of Focus Group meetings BAME colleagues asked the Trust to establish a programme of BAME Reference Group meetings, to be led by the Diversity and Inclusion Service (DIS) and held every 4 months, rather than the annual focus group meetings. The purpose of the meetings would be to:

- Develop a support network for BAME colleagues where they could share and explore issues confidentially
- Maintain regular face to face contact between the DIS and BAME representatives to update them on progress with the Trust's WRES improvement activities
- Provide a point of reference for the DIS to check out ideas for improvement.

The Chief Executive and the Director of Workforce and OD would be invited to attend the last section of the meeting to receive feedback on the issues discussed and agree next steps. This request was agreed and implemented.

Previously, when the DIS had suggested establishing a staff led BAME Network for Mid Yorkshire Hospitals NHS Trust (MYHT) at Focus Group meetings there had been little enthusiasm for the idea from participants. However, at a meeting of the Reference Group, when this idea was mentioned again, most of the BAME colleagues present were keen to progress the proposal so this idea is to be picked up as part of the 2019/20 WRES improvement plan.

Virtual BAME Network

To maintain contact with BAME colleagues in between Focus and Reference meetings DIS maintain a list of all BAME colleagues employed by the Trust and emails them regularly on a variety of topics.

This has approach has been especially successful in alerting colleagues to local, regional and national development programmes, particularly those aimed specifically at the BAME community. During 2018/19:

- The Chief Executive attended the graduation of four MYHT colleagues from the Moving Forward programme led by SWYPFT, which was aimed at BAME colleagues in Bands 5 and 6. The feedback we received about the content and impact was extremely positive
- Colleagues were successful in securing places on the national Stepping Up programme which is aimed at BAME staff. Three attended the programme for staff in Agenda for Change Bands 5 and 6 and one attended the Band 7 version
- One BAME colleague went on the national Resourceful and Resilient Change Makers programme.

3. Culture Change

MYHT Embedding Values and Behaviours (EVB) Programme

In 2016 and 2017 staff were engaged extensively in a review and revision of the corporate Values and Behaviours. There then followed a comprehensive publicity programme to raise awareness.

Despite all this work, when the Chief Executive met with staff at the Annual BAME Focus Group events in mid-2018, he again heard stories about the attitudes of local managers and their failure to tackle inappropriate behaviours. This was one of the motivations for him commissioning our OD team to deliver EVB which a mandatory three day development programme for all staff in Bands 7 and 8, to move our leadership culture towards excellent performance. The programme commenced in late 2018 and will run for the next three years until over 1000 managers have attended.

Dealing with Prejudice

During 2018 there was a spate of situations where patients or their relatives refused treatment or services from BAME staff purely based on their ethnicity or the colour of their skin. Whilst the Trust has zero tolerance to such discrimination it transpired that we did not have any guidelines for managers on how to respond in such situations.

Following extensive consultation, guidelines on *'Dealing with Patients, Relatives and Carers Who Refuse Care, Treatment or Services from Staff Based on Prejudice'* were approved by the Executive Team and publicised widely across the Trust. A key focus of the guidance is about ensuring that the staff who are subject to the prejudice are fully supported to help them through the anger, distress and upset such attitudes will cause.

The launch of the guidance was championed by one of our female Chaplains who was the subject of such prejudice when a family refused to let her provide ministry to their dying relative purely because she was black.

4. Development Opportunities

Moving Forward 2018

A statement in the NHS WRES Leadership Strategy published at the turn of the year resonates with the Trust:

Although well-intentioned, one of the limitations of previous efforts to improve BME staff representation at senior levels across the NHS is an over-focus upon the deficit model; the notion that there are inherent weaknesses or deficits amongst BME staff themselves, rather than deep-rooted issues within organisations

(NHS England, NHS Improvement: 2019)

That said however, the Trust recognises that BAME staff do need to be supported to expand their experiences and skills, particularly where the opportunities to do this have not been made readily available.

To this end the Trust obtained a number of places on the first cohort of the NHS Wakefield district Moving Forward programme which was delivered by colleagues in the South and West Yorkshire Partnership Foundation Trust and ran in 2018. It is a modular, 3-part programme for BAME staff in Bands 5 and 6 who are not currently in a management role but aspire to such roles within the next 18-months. Whilst it provides an insight into the leadership/management principles and practices it has a particular focus on the attributes that staff will need to develop in managing their careers.

The places were offered to all Band 5 and 6 BAME staff in MYHT and four colleagues secured places. The four graduated in summer 2018 with the Chief Executive attending to listen to their experiences and he was impressed by their enthusiasm and maturity. Since then at least one of the group has secured promotion.

The NHS Leadership Academy's Stepping Up Programme

The Stepping Up programme is a leadership development programme for aspiring BAME colleagues in Bands 5 and 6 who work within healthcare. It aims to create greater levels of sustainable inclusion within the NHS by addressing the social, organisational and psychological barriers restricting BAME colleagues from progressing. The programme is designed to bridge the gap between where applicants are and where they need to be, to progress into more senior roles.

As mentioned above, each time the Academy launch the programme the MYHT DIS use the virtual BAME Network to send details to colleagues and encourage them to apply. In 2018 three staff were successful in securing places and one has already gone on to achieve promotion.

Coaching and Mentoring

The MYHT DIS regularly promote the Trust's coaching and mentoring service to BAME colleagues to encourage them to access the facilities in support of their career development.

Career Conversations for BAME Nursing Colleagues in Band 6

Having identified a lack of progression to Band 6, particularly for nursing colleagues, we decided to invite BAME nursing staff who had already achieved this step up, to have a conversation with a senior member of the Workforce team about their experiences, future career goals and support needs.

Out of forty seven people in this cohort, eight eventually came forward to have a conversation in confidence. In terms of the issues raised, these included such things as:

- The need for BAME colleagues to demonstrate that they were significantly better than white staff, just to get noticed
- The lack of time and opportunity for accessing development opportunities
- The need to be extremely resilient and persistent to overcome repeated rejections at interview
- Repeatedly being told “*you were an excellent candidate but.....*”
- Some colleagues giving up on promotion after such repeated rejections
- Nepotism at a local level where managers would promote staff they socialised with
- Abuse that had to be tolerated in order to stay in the job

The colleagues we interviewed who were appointed through international recruitment also raised issues such as:

- Communication, language and terminology issues
- Differences in cultural knowledge and practical skills
- A lack of workplace support beyond induction programmes

These themes will be used to inform the development of improvement plan for the year ahead.

MYHT WRES RESULTS 2019

5. The full set of data MYHT submitted to NHS England is available on the Trust’s website and can be found by searching for *Workforce Information and EDI* on the Trust’s home page.
6. Appendix A provides general information as background to the 2019 WRES results, including details of the commissioners this paper will be shared with. It also shows that at 31 March 2019 we employed 8918 staff, this compares with 8412 at the same time last year; an increase of 506. There was also an increase in the number of BAME staff employed from 1183 in 2018 to 1233 in 2019; an increase of 50. However, whilst there was this increase in the total number, BAME representation in the workforce fell slightly from 14.1% to 13.8%.

7. Metric 1 – Workforce Composition

As the data shows, in line with many other acute trusts, MYHT has an over representation of BAME colleagues in the lower pay bands and the figures emphasise their lack of progression. This is a particularly feature in the clinical workforce. For example,

- At Band 2 BAME colleagues make up 10.6% of the workforce compared with 5.8% in Band 3
- In Band 5 BAME colleagues make up 18.6% of the workforce, compared with 9.3% in Band 6.

The Board is acutely aware of this issue and as such has introduced the following as part of its Strategic Workforce Targets for 2019/22, (in advance of the targets to be set by NHS England to address this issue nationally):

	18/19 Actual	19/20 Target	20/21 Target	21/22 Target
Increase the representation of BAME Clinical Staff at Band 3 and Band 6	B3 = 3.8% B6 = 9.1%	B3 = 4.5% B6 = 10.0%	B3 = 5.0% B6 = 11.0%	B3 = 5.5% B6 = 12.0%

The logic in setting these targets is that the focus on them and the actions that will be taken to achieve them will also improve progression for BAME staff in all other pay bands.

8. WRES Metrics 2 to 8 – Staff Experience

The 2019 MYHT results for WRES Metrics 2 to 8 are provided in Appendix B, which also compares these results with the MYHT 'scores' for the previous four years.

The points worthy of comment for these latest results are as follows:

- A improvement in Metric 2 (relatively likelihood of white staff being appointed from shortlisting compared to BAME staff) from 1.56 last year to 1.32 in 2019
- A significant improvement on Metric 3 (relative likelihood of BAME staff entering formal disciplinary compared to white staff) from 1.49 in 20198 to 1.06 in 2019. This was based on a significant reduction in the number of formal disciplinaries from 72 in 2018 to 41 in 2019; a fall of 46%
- Continuing equality of opportunity in staff accessing non mandatory training (Metric 4)
- A higher level of BAME staff reporting bullying and harassment from colleagues (31.58%) compared to white colleagues (24.44%); a difference of 7.14%
- A significant and ongoing reduction in the proportion of BAME staff believing the Trust provides equality of opportunities for career progression from 68.42% last year to 58.82%. This is significantly below the result for white staff which in 2019 was 84.44%. It is also really disappointing in view of the actions the Trust has been taking to support BAME colleagues in accessing training development and achieving success in career progression
- An increasingly higher level of BAME colleagues (20.69%) reporting discrimination by their manager compared to white colleagues (8.60%). Again this is disappointing bearing in mind the work being done with managers and supervisors through the EVB programme.

9. WRES Metric 9 – Board Composition

The result for this Metric shows an improvement in BAME representation in the Board's voting membership from 8.3% in 2018 to 18.2 % in 2019. Comparing this latest figure with BAME representation in the overall workforce (13.8%) gives a positive difference of 4.2%. The lack of any BAME representation amongst Executive Board members persists however, giving a negative difference of 13.8%.

10. Information on the actions planned for 2019/20, as the Trust's response to the issues and challenges identified above, is provided in the following section of the paper.

ACTIONS PLANNED FOR 2019/20

11. Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) Experts Training Programme

MYHT Lead Chaplain, who chairs our new BAME Staff Network, has been accepted on to the next cohort of the above programme. This means the Trust will have an additional source of expertise in this area who can work with DIS to advise the Board and work with the wider staff group to continue to improve the experience for BAME colleagues at work.

12. Culture Change

Just Culture

The Just Culture approach is based on the principle that the fair treatment of staff supports a culture of fairness, openness and learning in the NHS by making staff feel confident to speak up when things go wrong, rather than fearing blame.

Supporting staff to be open about mistakes allows valuable lessons to be learnt so the same errors can be prevented from being repeated. The aim is to promote cultural change, to move away from a blame culture.

One of the consequences seen in NHS organisations that are adopting the Just Culture approach is significant reductions in the number of formal disciplinarys and grievance and levels of bullying and harassment.

Whilst such a consequence will be a positive for all staff, the Trust expect that it will lead to equalisation of the proportion of BAME and White staff who do enter formal processes.

In June 2019 the Trust started its journey towards a just culture with a workshop involving managers and trade unions, a journey that will accelerate over the coming months.

13. Recruitment Processes

In order to address the progression issue for BAME staff, the trust is considering adopting schemes that have been trialled in other NHS organisations, particularly in relation to recruitment processes. For example:

Diverse shortlisting and interviewing panels: Recruiting managers would be held accountable for institutionalising diverse shortlisting and interview panels. There would seldom, be acceptable exceptions for not having a BME member on shortlisting and interview panels.

Where BME interviewees are not appointed, justification would be sent to the Director of Workforce and OD setting out clearly, the process followed and the reasons for not appointing the BME candidate.

Batch Interviews: Panel interviews of single applicants may not always provide the optimum assessment of a candidate's skills and capabilities, and can contribute towards creating conditions for bias.

The merits of interviewing a batch of candidates for a number of different roles or positions should be considered

Consideration will be given to exploring these approaches, initially on a pilot basis, to test their viability and effect and to facilitate the learning that will be needed to up-scale processes across the organisation.

14. Development Opportunities

Moving Forward 2019

The Trust has again been offered places on the NHS Wakefield District programme delivered by SWYPFT and four staff have already been accepted, three of whom are Band 5 nurses.

RCN Developing Leaders Programme

In partnership with the RCN, the Trust already runs a leadership development programme for nursing staff in Bands 6 & 7 (Clinical Leadership Programme) and for care staff in Bands 2 – 4 (Introduction to Leadership Programme). Discussions are currently taking place about running a MYHT programme for Band 5 nurses (Developing Leadership Programme), aimed specifically at BAME staff, in early 2020.

Stepping Up Programme

In addition to promoting the national programme and encouraging our staff to apply, the Director of workforce and OD has initiated discussion with the local office of the Leadership Academy to explore the possibility of running a full programme just for MYHT BAME staff.

NHS General Manager Training Scheme (GMTS) 2019

For reasons outlined in the NHS Plan (2019) & Interim NHS People Plan (2019), the NHS has increased the scheme's capacity to 500 training places. To get anywhere near 500, the NHS is looking to recruit from its existing workforce, as well as attract the more traditional graduate applicants. As such DIS has emailed all Band 3 – 6 BAME colleagues to encourage them to consider applying. This has created a significant amount of interest in the scheme.

15. Support

BAME Network

As described in paragraph 2 above, at a meeting of the BAME Reference in June 2019 it was agreed that a staff led BAME Network should be established. Subsequently our Lead Chaplain, who had been involved in such a network in a large Teaching Hospital, agreed to lead the development of the MYHT Network and to chair it once established.

Work to agree the Terms of Reference and set up the Network is underway with the first meeting planned for autumn 2019.

Coaching and Mentoring

The MYHT DIS will continue to promote the Trust's coaching and mentoring service to BAME colleagues to encourage them to access the facilities in support of their career development.

Reciprocal Mentoring

The Trust continues to monitor the development of the reciprocal mentoring approach in the NHS and the extent to which it can improve career progression for BAME staff. It is one of the options we will be considering in the year ahead.

CONCLUSIONS

16. Whilst there has been significant work by the Trust in recent years to improve the experience of BAME staff, this is not yet being reflected consistently in our annual WRES results. However, we believe that the move toward a Just Culture will see a step change in the experience for all staff which will be reflected in WRES results going forward.

Workforce Race Equality Standard 2018 - 19

Background Information

1. Name and title of Board lead for the Workforce Race Equality Standard

Director of Workforce and Organisational Development

2. Name and contact details of lead manager compiling this report

Gordon Smith: gordon.smith@midyorks.nhs 01924 543551

3. Names of commissioners this report has been sent to

Wakefield CCG
North Kirklees CCG

4. Name/contact details of co-ordinating commissioner report sent to

Ruth Unwin Ruth.Unwin@wakefieldccg.nhs.uk 01924 213050

5. Background narrative

a. Any issues of completeness of data

None Known

b. Any matters relating to reliability of comparisons with previous years

None Known

6. Total numbers of staff

a. Employed within this organisation at the date of the report

8918

b. Proportion of BAME staff employed within this organisation at date of report

1233 / 8918 = 13.8%

7. Self-Reporting

- a. The proportion of total staff who have self-reported their ethnicity

99.0%

- b. Have any steps been taken in the last reporting period to improve the level of self-reporting by ethnicity

No Action Required

- c. Are any steps planned during the current reporting period to improve the level of self-reporting by ethnicity

No Action Required

APPENDIX B

Comparison of MYHT WRES Metrics 2 – 8 over Last Five Years 2019

METRIC	2015 (SAMPLE)	2016 (FULL)	2017 (SAMPLE)	2018 (FULL)	2019 (SAMPLE)
2. Relative likelihood of staff being appointed from shortlisting	1.52	1.11	1.05	1.56	1.68
3. Relative likelihood of staff entering the formal disciplinary process (2 year Average)	1.16	1.14	0.93	1.49	1.06
4. Relative likelihood of staff accessing non-mandatory training	0.92	0.90	0.81	1.14	1.00
5. KF 25. Percentage of staff experiencing BHA from patients, relatives or the public in last 12 months	W 25%	W 26.81%	W 26.65%	W 25.19%	W 27.4%
	B 30%	B 24.79%	B 25.58%	B 28.13%	B 25.9%
6. KF 26. Percentage of staff experiencing BHA from colleagues in last 12 months	W 24%	W 25.22%	W 20.55%	W 23.59%	W 24.44%
	B 30%	B 29.22%	B 21.43%	B 30.18%	B 31.58%
7. Percentage staff believing that trust provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion	W 89%	W 84.14%	W 86.50%	W 84.03%	W 84.44%
	B 88%	B 74.15%	B 81.48%	B 68.42%	B 58.82%
8. Percentage in the last 12 experiencing discrimination at work Manager/team leader	W 7.17%	W 6.30%	W 6.40%	W 5.83%	W 8.60%
	B 10.71%	B 13.22%	B 11.36%	B 17.74%	B 20.69%

Notes:

1. BHA = Bullying, Harassment or Abuse
2. For Metrics 2, 3 & 4 the closer to 1 the score the more even the experience of BAME and white staff. Scores above 1 indicate an 'advantage' to white staff so conversely, scores below 1 indicate an advantage to BAME staff